Євген Анатолійович Гетьман

Національна академія правових наук України
Харків, Україна

Кафедра міжнародного приватного права та порівняльного правознавства
Національний юридичний університет імені Ярослава Мудрого
Харків, Україна

В'ячеслав Станіславович Політанський

Відділ координації правових досліджень
Національна академія правових наук України
Харків, Україна

Кафедра теорії і філософії права
Національний юридичний університет імені Ярослава Мудрого
Харків, Україна

Ігор Вікторович Семеніхін

Кафедра теорії і філософії права
Національний юридичний університет імені Ярослава Мудрого
Харків, Україна

ПРАКТИКА ВПРОВАДЖЕННЯ ЕЛЕКТРОННИХ АДМІНІСТРАТИВНИХ ПОСЛУГ В УКРАЇНІ

Анотація. *Одним із факторів розвитку громадянського суспільства в Україні є дієвий, налагоджено функціонуючий інститут надання адміністративних електронних послуг. Незважаючи на інтенсивність та широкий спектр досліджень, присвячених різним аспектам надання електронних адміністративних послуг населенню, багато питань у цій сфері залишаються досить дискусійними, а також недостатньо дослідженими, що й обумовило актуальність роботи. Стаття направлена на дослідження організаційних та процедурних аспектів надання електронних адміністративних послуг в Україні. З'ясовано значення деяких фундаментальних понять цієї проблематики. Сформульовано авторський підхід до визначення поняття електронних адміністративних послуг, що ґрунтується на власному розумінні цього поняття, з позиції загальнотеоретичного аналізу. Проаналізовано адміністративні механізми впровадження електронних державних послуг. Досліджено особливості класифікації адміністративних послуг в електронному вигляді за видами електронного подання, за сферою діяльності, за формою власності, за споживачами, за місцем отримання з точки зору клієнта та з точки зору залучення в електронний сервіс. Вперше поетапно та хронологічно проаналізовано нормативно-правову базу України з питань надання електронних адміністративних послуг. Здійснено дослідження та порівняння особливостей процедури надання електронних адміністративних послуг за допомогою Єдиного державного порталу адміністративних послуг, порталу державних електронних послуг iGov та українського онлайн-сервісу державних послуг Дія. Розкрито процедуру діяльності центрів надання адміністративних послуг в Україні. Зроблено висновок про те, що першим кроком України в напрямі створення власного інформаційного суспільства шляхом запровадження електронного урядування має стати формування ринку адміністративних та інформаційних електронних послуг*

Ключові слова: *електронне урядування, інформаційно-комунікаційні технології, електронні послуги, Єдиний державний портал адміністративних послуг, Інтернет*

Yevhen A. Hetman

National Academy of Legal Sciences of Ukraine
Kharkiv, Ukraine

Department of Private International Law and Comparative Law
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University
Kharkiv, Ukraine

Viacheslav S. Politanskyi

Department of the Coordination of Legal Studies
National Academy of Legal Sciences of Ukraine,
Kharkiv, Ukraine

Department of Theory and Philosophy of Law
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University
Kharkiv, Ukraine

Ihor V. Semenikhin

Department of Theory and Philosophy of Law
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University
Kharkiv, Ukraine

IMPLEMENTATION PRACTICE OF ELECTRONIC ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES IN UKRAINE

Abstract. *One of the factors for the development of civil society in Ukraine is an effective, well-functioning institution for providing administrative electronic services. Despite the intensity and wide scope of research covering various aspects of providing electronic administrative services to the population, many issues in this area remain quite debatable, as well as understudied, which conditioned the relevance of the study. The study is aimed at studying the organisational and procedural aspects of providing electronic administrative services in Ukraine. Authors of this study clarified the significance of some fundamental concepts of this issue. The author's approach to defining the concept of electronic administrative services was formulated based on a personal interpretation of this concept from the standpoint of general theoretical analysis. Administrative mechanisms for implementing electronic public services were analysed. The study investigated the features of classification of electronic administrative services by types of electronic representation, by field of activity, by form of ownership, by consumers, by place of receipt from the standpoint of the client and from the standpoint of involvement in the electronic service. This study is the first to analyse the regulatory framework of Ukraine on the provision of electronic administrative services in stages and chronologically. Authors studied and compared the features of the procedure for rendering electronic administrative services using the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services, the iGov portal of state electronic services and the Ukrainian online service of public services – Diia. The study covered the procedure for the operation of administrative service centres in Ukraine. It was concluded that the first step of Ukraine towards creating its information society through the introduction of e-governance should be the establishment of a market for administrative and information electronic services*

Keywords: *electronic management, information and communication technologies, electronic services, Unified State Portal of Administrative Services, Internet*

INTRODUCTION

The study of the problems of administrative and legal support of access to administrative services within e-governance in Ukraine becomes particularly important in the context of modern European integration processes and the development of the concept of e-governance in Ukraine, the reform of public administration, as well as the development of information technologies. The primary basis of electronic administrative services is e-governance – a fundamentally new way of exercising state power towards developing democracy using a wide range of advanced and innovative electronic information and communication technologies that ensure the provision of qualitatively new and diverse public services in real time for all categories of persons, both internationally and nationally and regionally [1, p.100].

The modern state does not manage society but provides it with services. Citizens are not petitioners in relations with public authorities, but consumers of public services [2, p. 150]. The methodological basis for the development of the infrastructure of interaction between the authorities and citizens is the concept of state service to the citizen – the service concept of public administration as a modern understanding of the social purpose of the state, where the priority task of democratic governance is to serve civil society, and the main form of activity of government institutions is the provision of public services [3, p. 524].

The relevance of the introduction of electronic services in Ukraine is explained by the priority of developing the information society and the service state, focused on considering the interests and needs of citizens, improving their quality of life. Defining a new mission and developing a strategy for the activities of public authorities leads to the development of new management functions and ways to render administrative services. The latter forces adjusting administrative processes and regulations, seeking new mechanisms and technologies to render administrative services [2, p. 189]. The introduction of electronic administrative services in Ukraine provides essential advantages for state and local government bodies and consumers of public services, namely: simplifies the processes of developing state information systems and managing state information; provides better compatibility and interaction with other institutions; facilitates the ability to navigate for the consumers and perform online navigation in a set of various public services [4, p. 473].

Notably, the introduction of electronic administrative regulations is an innovative approach to analysing the organisational and functional structure of public authorities and developing new models for describing their operation. As a result, the study of the problems of electronic administrative services within the framework of e-governance in Ukraine is important for the development of Ukrainian science and technology and substantial modernisation of the administrative and legal bases for regulating information relations, in particular, regarding the development and implementation of the national policy for the development of the information society, informatisation and e-governance, which allows implementing a considerable number of tasks of further socio-economic and political development of Ukraine and harmonious entry into the world information society [5, p. 301]. Furthermore, in contrast to the subject of information society development, which has already become conventional, the subject of legal and administrative and organisational support for the provision of public electronic services remains practically understudied in Ukraine [6, p. 1059].

The study of the practice of implementing electronic administrative services in Ukraine and summarising the existing array of developments on this issue is challenging, which explains the lack of research on this subject. Some aspects of this issue have been addressed to a certain extent by such foreign and Ukrainian scientists as A. Al-Refaie [7], M. Csótó [8], M. Kaluti [9], A. Klich [10], V. Margariti [5], S.A. Marzooqi [11], C. Misuraca [6], E.A. Nuaimi [11], H.M. Park [12], N.A. Qirim [11], A. Ramadna [7], J. Rocha [13], D. Špaček [8], N. Urs [8], V.M. Babaiev [14], O.M. Bukhanevych [15], S.Ya. Danylevych [16], O.P. Dzoban [17], P.S. Klimushyn [18], N. Kozachenko [19], I.S. Kuspliak [20], O.V. Litvinov [21], A.A. Mirzoian [22], L.P. Trebyk [23].

The purpose of this study lies in studying the practice of implementing electronic administrative services in Ukraine based on summarising the available array of developments of well-known Ukrainian and foreign researchers and scientists, as well as in providing the author's concept and conclusions regarding electronic administrative services.

1. MATERIALS AND METHODS

To achieve the formulated goals and objectives, the research used general scientific and special legal methods and means of scientific cognition. This allowed carefully analysing all questions concerning the specific features of implementing electronic administrative services in Ukraine. Thus, the historical method allowed establishing that Ukraine adopted the idea of electronic administrative services from the experience of Western countries, where the doctrine of "new public management" and the orientation of the state/authorities towards the citizen as a client has been flourishing since the 1980s. In 1998, the idea of administrative (managerial) services was first recorded in the Concept of Administrative Reform in Ukraine.

The dialectical method allowed investigating and gaining new knowledge about the content and ideas of electronic administrative services, which constitute one of the e-government structural elements and represent a certain method of finding new approaches to analysing the structure of state processes and seeking new models for describing state activities, which, in turn, make it more convenient, faster, and more efficient. The comparative legal method was used for research and comparison of the regulatory framework, portals and government organisations that have the purpose of implementation and development of electronic administrative services in Ukraine. A vast array was explored: regulatory framework of electronic administrative services starting from the moment of its consolidation by Ukraine as an independent state and finishing with modern realities; portals of electronic administrative services both at the national and regional levels; state organisations, whose purpose is to provide a considerable number of different electronic administrative services.

The synthesis method helped gain new knowledge that the provision of electronic administrative services in Ukraine is the main prerogative of the union of the government and the Ukrainian people and one of the main priorities for the development of e-governance in Ukraine and the world, and the availability of such services is one of the criteria for a full and prominent level of development of Ukraine. Furthermore, this method helped establish that there are many state organisations in Ukraine that successfully render a considerable number of different electronic administrative services, namely electronic administrative services of the State Service for Geodesy, Cartography, and Cadastre of Ukraine; electronic administrative services of the State

Architectural and Construction Inspectorate of Ukraine; electronic administrative services of the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine; electronic administrative services of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine; electronic administrative services of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine; electronic services of the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine; electronic services of the Pension Fund of Ukraine.

The method of analysis helped establish that the main document governing the activities concerning the provision of administrative services in Ukraine is the Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services", which defines the legal framework for the implementation of the rights, freedoms, and legitimate interests of individuals and legal entities in the field of administrative services. Moreover, using the analysis method, the authors identified three portals of electronic administrative services in Ukraine, namely the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services (https://my.gov.ua/), Portal of State Electronic Services – iGov (https://igov.org.ua/) and the Ukrainian online public services portal – Diia (https://diia.gov.ua/), where the first one is an official source of information on the provision of administrative services in Ukraine, the second is the undisputed leader in the number of services ordered and received, and the third is a promising portal that will become a universal point of access for citizens and businesses to all electronic public services according to uniform standards.

The method of extrapolation helped establish that the system of electronic administrative services in Ukraine will not be able to function effectively without a reliable and accessible information infrastructure, ensuring effective administration of the system of electronic administrative services, the availability of professional personnel and motivated heads of public administration bodies, eliminating unnecessary bureaucratic obstacles, and the development of useful and high-quality administrative services. Using the method of interpretation, it became possible to give the author's innovative and legal definition of the concept of electronic administrative services, based on their understanding of this term, from the standpoint of theoretical and legal analysis and modern challenges to the development of society.

The system method allowed establishing that the first step of Ukraine towards creating its information society through the introduction of e-governance should be the establishment of a market for administrative and information electronic services. It should become the engine that would enable the development of a new paradigm of public administration in developing e-governance, which aims to improve the well-being of the population, increase the competitiveness of Ukrainian enterprises and the state in general, and ensure new priorities for the development of Ukraine. The generalisation method revealed the key objectives in the provision of electronic administrative services in Ukraine, which will positively impact the development of the social state with influential civil society institutions, especially those issues where methods and forms of interaction of public administration bodies with citizens and business entities are of great importance.

2. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION
2.1 The concept of electronic public service and mechanisms for its implementation
The legal literature contains different opinions on the term "service". Some scientists believe that a service is an activity aimed at obtaining an intangible result [22, p.136]. That is why it is possible to distinguish certain features inherent in the institution of administrative services: provided at the request of an individual or legal entity; concern the rights and/or obligations of such a person, that is, an administrative service is rendered to ensure the acquisition, change, or termination of the rights and/or obligations of persons; rendered by administrative bodies (primarily executive authorities, local self-government, other state bodies) compulsorily through the exercise of power because the administrative body has a "monopoly" on the provision of a particular administrative service [19, p. 197-198].

Thus, a public service comprises one or more processes that can be performed in various state structures that are endowed with a certain responsibility and have the ability to perform a certain expert analysis. In further decomposition, the process (regulation) can be divided into sub-processes (steps) and operations. Multiple institutions can take part in the same process. The activities of any organisation, including the state one, comprise three levels of processes: 1) primary activity (implementation of the functions of the institution prescribed in the corresponding statutory documents); 2) secondary activity (aimed at improving the main function: information systems and organisation technologies); 3) activity aimed at improving the function (development of the strategy and architecture of information technologies of the organisation) [17, p. 152].

Determination of a modern political mission statement and objectives of a new quality, as well as design of a strategy for government bodies, lead to the development of new management functions and new ways of rendering public services. They aim to adjust administrative services and search for latest information technologies for providing public services. [9, p. 1059]. Most importantly, political goals are formulated at the state level, considering national interests and opportunities for their implementation on the part of the authorities. Then tasks are defined that require the provision of certain services to citizens, businesses, and other government organisations and institutions based on administrative services. And only in the end is the attention drawn to technologies that ensure the implementation of administrative services [10, p. 9]. The introduction of administrative services in electronic form is one of the main ideas of e-governance. In general, electronic services are understood as distinct types of tangible and intangible services rendered in electronic form using information and communication technologies, including the Internet [14, p. 96]. L.B. Trebyk noted that electronic administrative services are administrative services implemented using e-governance technologies, when the subject of the request ordered and received an administrative service from the subject of provision as a result of the exercise of their authority in electronic form [23, p. 9].

Proceeding from this, it is still necessary to interpret

it in a slightly different form: an electronic administrative service is any state information service of a public administrative nature, implemented through the use of information and communication technologies and the Internet, rendered to the subject of appeal by state and local government bodies in electronic form, and has the goal of improving the quality and the process of their provision. [1, p. 99]. It is the provision of electronic administrative services that is the main prerequisite for bringing power closer to the average citizen, meeting their needs and one of the main priorities for the development of e-governance in the world, while the availability of electronic administrative services in a modern state constitutes one of the criteria for its full and high development level.

The mechanisms for providing administrative services in electronic form are different. Thus, P.S. Klimushyn identified the following mechanisms for implementing electronic public services: administrative, institutional, identification, intra-government, single access points, integration, unified architecture of integrated applications. The author understands the administrative mechanisms of implementing electronic public services as their grouping in the corresponding life episodes and business situations [18, p. 4-7].

Of particular interest is the position of I.S. Kuspliak, who suggested dividing electronic administrative services by types of electronic representation, by scope of activity, by form of ownership, by consumers, by place of receipt from the client's standpoint and from the standpoint of involvement in the electronic service:

1. By types of electronic representation: informing; one-way interaction; two-way interaction; conducting transactions.

2. By the scope of activity: information services; consulting services; services for the preparation of political decisions or laws; services for interaction between institutions and organisations; services for providing aid and support; services for public procurement operations; services for the implementation of supervision and control functions by state departments.

3. By form of ownership: services rendered by the central executive bodies and their enterprises; by local state authorities; by local self-government bodies; and by business organisations.

4. By consumers, the services differ for public authorities, citizens, and business organisations as follows: B2B (Business-to-Business) primarily provides various ways of electronic interaction between business organisations; B2C (Business-to-Citizens) is described by the fact that the service consumer is a private person who, for example, purchases goods and services via the Internet; G2B (Government-to-Business) – public procurement operations; G2C (Government-to-Citizens) – various types of electronic

administrative services to the population; G2G (Government-to-Government) – data exchange through electronic exchangers between government actors. This includes internal and interagency exchanges at the national level, as well as exchanges between national, regional, and local levels; C2C (Citizens-to-Citizens) – electronic auctions, bulletin boards, etc.

5. By the place of receipt from the client's standpoint: the first stage – conversion of a public service into electronic form allows considering services from various positions for the client. The second stage – creation of institutions that work on the principle of a "single-window concept", but without the Internet. The third stage – publication of information and interactive forms for receiving the service on the portal of a public authority, the ability to download and send these forms.

6. From the standpoint of involvement in the electronic service: fully automated and partially automated; fully automated; partially automated [20, p. 120-126].

2.2 Ukrainian experience in the development of electronic administrative services

As for the development of criteria for the quality of administrative services in electronic form, there may be criteria that are defined in the concept of development of the system of providing administrative services by authorities, "which should serve as a model for administrative services in electronic form". Such criteria are as follows: effectiveness; timeliness; accessibility; convenience; openness; professionalism, etc. [24, p.18].

One of the primary areas of activity on public services in developed countries has been the introduction of information technologies for the provision of services. This applies both to the digitalisation of individual services and to the creation of web portals dedicated to public services [25, p. 11]. The legal foundation for the development of a system of administrative services using the capabilities of special electronic data processing technologies has been laid a long time ago. Thus, for citizens to exercise their constitutional rights to free access to information on the activities of state authorities, as well as to ensure the transparency and openness of their activities, the Procedure for Publishing Information on the Activities of Executive Authorities on the Internet was adopted, approved by the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 3[1] and subsequently by the Law of Ukraine No. 2939-VI "On Access to Public Information" of January 13, 2011[2].

In 2004, a Draft National Target Programme for Reforming Public Administration and Public Service for 2011-2015 was developed within the framework of international technical assistance, posted on the website of the Centre for Adaptation of Public Service to the European

---

1. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 3 "On the Procedure for Publishing Information on the Activities of Executive Authorities on the Internet". (2002, January). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/3-2002-%D0%BF#Text.

2. Law of Ukraine No. 2939-VI "On Access to Public Information". (2005, June). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2709-15#Text.

Union Standards (the Centre was established and operates under the Main Department of Public Service of Ukraine, in accordance with the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 485 of April 14, 2004), and containing measures for the transition of public authorities to paperless (electronic) document management tools and building a system for rendering electronic administrative services[1].

As early as in 2010, the Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine approved the Concept of E-government Development in Ukraine, according to which, the purpose of introducing e-governance is to create qualitatively new forms of organising the activities of state authorities and local self-government bodies, their interaction with citizens and business entities by providing access to state information resources, the ability to receive electronic administrative services, apply to state authorities and local self-government bodies using the Internet[2].

The main document governing the activities concerning the provision of administrative services in Ukraine is the Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services"[3], which defines the legal framework for the implementation of the rights, freedoms, and legitimate interests of individuals and legal entities in the field of administrative services. According to Article 1 of this Law, an administrative service (which can be rendered in electronic form) should be understood as the result of the exercise of power by the subject of rendering administrative services at the request of an individual or legal entity, aimed at acquiring, changing, or terminating the rights and/or obligations of such a person in accordance with the law[4].

In this regard, the Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 386-p of May 15, 2013, which approved Information Society Development Strategy in Ukraine[5], describes the provision of electronic administrative services. Thus, it is planned to ensure the efficiency and quality of administrative services to the population and businesses rendered using information and communication technologies; the creation of a system of electronic interaction of state bodies; the creation of a unified state portal of administrative services to ensure the provision of administrative services

by executive authorities, other state bodies, local self-government bodies to citizens and organisations[6].

The entry into force of the Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services"[7], laid the foundations and defined the rules for the operation of the administrative services sector, the development of administrative service centres and the All-Ukrainian portal of administrative services. The Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services"[8], identified ways to develop the system of administrative services. This Law virtually created the basis for the development of rendering electronic administrative services. To implement this Law, state authorities started developing a legislative framework for rendering electronic administrative services. Thus, many regulations governing the maintenance of the Register of Administrative Services were adopted[9].

2.3 Ukrainian portals of electronic administrative services

In accordance with Article 17 of the Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services", the provision of electronic administrative services and access of subjects to information on administrative services using the Internet are ensured through the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services[10]. Effectively, the portal started working in March 2016. This portal has become an official source of information on the provision of electronic administrative services in Ukraine. The information is placed on the portal by the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine based on information received from the subjects of rendering administrative services and/or officials of state bodies, local self-government bodies who have been granted the corresponding access rights to the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services[11]. In particular, Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 13 of January 3, 2013, established a mechanism for maintaining the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services, which is conducted to ensure access of subjects to information on administrative services using the Internet and constitutes the official source of information on the provision of administrative services[12].

The Unified State Portal of Administrative Services provides as follows: access to information on administrative

---

1. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 485 "On Establishment of the Centre of Assistance to Institutional Development of Civil Service". (2004, April). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/485-2004-%D0%BF#Text.

2. Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 649-p "On Approval of the Concept of E-governance Development in Ukraine". (2017, September). Retrieved from http://zakon2.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2250-2010-%D1%80/ed20110926.

3. Law of Ukraine No. 5203-VI "On Administrative Services". (2012, September). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/2709-15#Text.

4. *Ibidem, 2012.*

5. Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 386-p "On Approval of the Information Society Development Strategy in Ukraine". (2013, May). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/386-2013-%D1%80#Text.

6. *Ibidem, 2013.*

7. Law of Ukraine No. 5203-VI "On Administrative Services", op. cit.

8. *Ibidem, 2012.*

9. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 1274 "On the Register of Administrative Services". (2011, December). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1274-2011-%D0%BF#Text.

10. Law of Ukraine No. 5203-VI "On Administrative Services", op. cit.

11. Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 718-p "On Approval of the Action Plan for the Creation of the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services". (2013, September). Retrieved from http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/718-2013-%D1%80.

12. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 13 "On Approval of the Procedure for Maintaining the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services". (2013, January). Retrieved from http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/13-2013-%D0%BF.

services provided rendered to subjects of appeal; access to information on centres and subjects of rendering administrative services; search by keywords in the fields of the description of administrative services; classification and search for services by life situations and categories; download of electronic application forms and other documents by subjects of appeal that must be filled out and submitted for receiving administrative services; submission of an online application for public services; payment of the established fee for the public services to be rendered, using electronic payment systems; tracking the stages of completion for documents on the provision of public services; tracking statistics of visits; data protection (including personal data of subjects of appeal) from unauthorised access, destruction, alteration, and blocking by implementing organisational and technical measures, means, and methods of technical protection of information; delineation and control of access to information that is on the portal, according to the powers of users; registration of events that occur on the portal and relate to its security; presentation of the structure of information resources and user-friendly Ukrainian-language interfaces.

In more detail, the specific features of operation of the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services are regulated by the Procedure for Maintaining the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services No. 13 of January 3, 2013[1]. In 2015-2016, the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services was modernised: its interface became more convenient to use (information on administrative services is systematised by topic), user authorisation using an electronic digital signature was introduced, as well as the provision of certain services of central executive authorities through the Portal [26]. Currently, the portal holds all the information necessary to receive a particular service. Effectively, the portal resembles an electronic information bureau, where for each particular service the information is collected regarding the list of documents, the place where one can receive this service, and the forms of documents approved by law. Therefore, the creation of a Unified Portal of Administrative Services should be generally considered as a call sign of the first step towards the development of a full-fledged system for rendering electronic administrative services. Notably, along with the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services, there is the Portal of State Electronic Services – iGov, which was created in June 2015 by a team of volunteers with the support of the E-Government Agency together with the Ministry of Economy and the Presidential Administration. The main purpose of creating this Portal was to obtain certificates and documents in electronic form or pre-order them without having to wait in line [11, p. 9].

The State Electronic Portal iGov can render three types of services, namely: 1. Fully electronic service, i.e., the process of ordering and receiving a service makes provision for the exclusion of a citizen's contact with a state body; 2. Reduced visits to government agencies. Documents are submitted to the state body in electronic form, but to receive a decision, a citizen must come to the state body for a document; 3. Electronic queue, i.e., some services cannot be fully

implemented electronically. This applies, for example, to the service of obtaining a passport or driving licence. Such services make provision for the personal submission of documents and the physical presence of a citizen in a state body. However, in practice, such services force citizens to spend a lot of time in a live queue, which is why an electronic queue was created [12, p. 2477]. In this regard, A.M. Bukhanevych noted that "in general, the idea of creating a portal iGov.org.ua deserves attention, but such a portal should be a Unified State Portal of Administrative Services, which should ensure the provision of electronic administrative services. There are legal grounds for this, which follow from the Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services" [15, p. 59].

The advantage of using iGov is that many volunteer programmers are involved, who are engaged in spot development of the Portal in their spare time, which saves an extremely large amount of money, since this category of employees is the most paid in any IT project. Taking the cost of services as a basis, one can calculate the costs of developing one service on both portals. In this case, the portal of public services iGov is cheaper, although this is not the final cost, and it cannot be taken as the main one. However, even if the cost of one service is within 20%, the picture will not change because by its nature the Portal is built on volunteering, hence will be less costly.

Furthermore, the iGov Public Services Portal has an indisputable drawback in its activities, which is the lack of legislative approval for working with this portal, since volunteers agree to launch services in their regions. The distribution of these services is uneven, and there is also huge resistance from local authorities, who are often not interested in implementing electronic services. A common feature of these portals is that they are both designed to simplify communication between citizens and civil servants, making the process of ordering services simple and accessible to all citizens of Ukraine, so one should factor in the quantity of services ordered and received by citizens through these portals.

An equally important indicator is the number of services that were rendered through the portal. It is particularly noticeable that the iGov Public Services Portal is the undisputed leader in this category. Despite the number of services ordered and received in general, the portal increases the number of customers using the services by an average of 10-15% every month. This means that citizens' trust in the portal is quite high. In addition, apart from the number of services rendered, the quality of these services is equally important according to the users' opinion. On the iGov Public Services Portal, citizens can rate the service rendered from 1 to 5, as well as leave a review on these services. As for the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services, it is completely impossible to evaluate the quality of services rendered or leave a review, and there is also no counter for the number of services rendered [16, p. 67].

At the same time, on September 27, 2019, the Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine, together with

1. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 13 "On Approval of the Procedure for Maintaining the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services". (2013, January). Retrieved from http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/13-2013-%D0%BF.

Fedoriv and Spiilka design büro, presented the digital state brand "Diia", where the Minister of Digital Transformation Mikhail Fedorov announced the launch of a website and applications for receiving public services online and stated that the first services would be available by the end of 2019, and that by 2022, 100% of public services can be received online. Diia ("Дія" – abbreviation for "Держава і я" – "State and I") is a Ukrainian application for public services developed by the Ministry of Digital Transformation of Ukraine. This is a mobile application with digital documents and a portal with public services. One of the first services in the app was an E-driving licence and a certificate for registration (logbook) of the vehicle. Diia is the start of building a state in a smartphone. It is what Ukrainians dreamed of – that the state should be efficient, almost invisible, not create problems, but on the contrary be a convenient service. Ukrainians will no longer need to spend time and nerves in endless queues of administrative institutions [27].

As of 2021, the portal renders two types of services: for citizens and for businesses. Citizens are provided with the following services: digital passport; certificates and extracts; environment; security, law and order; family; pensions, benefits, and aid; transport; land, construction, real estate; licences and permits; entrepreneurship. Thus, for example, on April 15, 2020, the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine adopted a resolution "On the Implementation of the Pilot Project Regarding the Use of Electronic Display of Information Contained in the Passport of a Citizen of Ukraine in the Form of a Card, and Electronic Display of Information Contained in the Passport of a Citizen of Ukraine for Travel Abroad". Electronic versions of the ID card and passport are already accessible in the mobile application "Diia"[1].

A digital passport is more reliable than a paper one and no less reliable than a plastic one. Using an electronic passport, one can travel by plane or train within the country, receive postal services, and conduct banking operations. One can also use their passport in the Diia mobile app to confirm their age when buying cigarettes or alcoholic beverages in the store. One can receive medical services, hotel services, or present them to law enforcement agencies. Using a digital passport, one can also use the library, get communication services, enter administrative buildings, and receive public services in the Centres for Administrative Services, on the Diia portal, or to receive funds upon returning goods. The passport data of every citizen who has installed the Diia mobile application is securely protected. The mobile application does not collect or store them, but only displays the information that is available in the registers. All digital documents in the Diia mobile application are valid only on the territory of Ukraine. A foreign passport provides the same rights and opportunities

as a national one. If a citizen does not have a driving licence or ID card, they can verify their identity using a foreign passport, which is available in "Diia" [28].

Businesses are provided with the following services: land, construction, real estate; licences and permits; transport; medicine and pharmaceuticals; extracts and references; business creation [29]. Based on the analysis of these three portals, the state is faced with a choice: 1) to develop the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services; 2) to adopt a volunteer iGov Public Services Portal and continue developing it; 3) to create a promising portal that citizens and businesses would use as a universal point of access to all electronic public services according to uniform standards, where everything is fast, express, and clear, where one can receive the service on demand, and, subsequently, where all departments would be united into a single convenient and effective online system.

2.4 State organisations that provide various electronic administrative services

At present, there are already many state organisations in Ukraine that successfully provide a considerable number of various electronic administrative services. Thus, for example:

1) electronic administrative services of the State Service for Geodesy, Cartography and Cadastre of Ukraine, which provide such services as ordering an extract from the State Land Cadastre on a land plot; ordering an extract on the standard monetary valuation of land; obtaining information about the owners and users of land plots [30, p. 3];

2) electronic administrative services of the State Architectural and Construction Inspectorate of Ukraine: registration of a notice on the start of preparatory work; registration of declarations on the start of preparatory work; registration of a notice on the start of construction work; registration of declarations on the start of construction work; registration of declarations on the object readiness for operation (pilot implementation in the Volynska Oblast) [13];

3) electronic administrative services of the Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources of Ukraine. In July 2015, the first electronic service in the environmental sphere "Waste Declaration" was presented (menr.in.ua). When rendering this public service, an automated declaration form is provided to minimise errors in the process of filling it out. The system contains an integrated online calculator for waste indicators of a business entity. The business entity receives information on the progress of consideration of the declaration and its registration by e-mail [31];

4) electronic administrative services of the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine. In Q4 2015, the Ministry of Economic Development and Trade of Ukraine launched the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services for test operation (poslugy.gov.ua), which hosted the

---

1. Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 278 "On the Implementation of the Pilot Project Regarding the Use of Electronic Display of Information Contained in the Passport of a Citizen of Ukraine in the Form of a Card, and Electronic Display of Information Contained in the Passport of a Citizen of Ukraine for Travel Abroad". (2020, April). Retrieved from https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/278-2020-%D0%BF#Text.

first 15 electronic administrative services rendered by this Ministry [7, p. 39];

5) electronic administrative services of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine. Currently, the number of electronic services rendered by the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine is the largest compared to other ministries and central executive authorities. Through the Electronic Services Cabinet of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine (kap.minjust.gov.ua) visitors are offered: obtaining documents online from State Registers of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine; electronic registration actions in State Registers of Ukraine; search for information in State Registers of Ukraine; use of electronic reporting systems for persons engaged in specialised professional activities; participation in electronic auctions of seized property, etc. [32];

6) electronic services of the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine. The State Fiscal Service of Ukraine is one of the first bodies in Ukraine to develop electronic services and services for taxpayers. The web portal of the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine (sfs.gov.ua) hosts many electronic services. The most popular services include Public Information and Reference Resource, Electronic Taxpayer Cabinet, Learn More about Your Business Partner, Verification of the Single Taxpayer Certificate, Electronic Accounting, Register of Policyholders, Cancelled Registration of VAT Payers, Pulse, Online Declaration, Customs statistics, Accredited Key Certification Centre, Electronic Customs, Mass Registration Addresses [33, p. 231];

7) electronic services of the Pension Fund of Ukraine. Electronic services that a user can get on the web portal of the Pension Fund of Ukraine (portal.pfu.gov.ua) after registration are as follows: receiving information from personalised accounting (for working citizens); receiving pension information (for pensioners); forming requests for preliminary preparation of documents; the possibility of filing complaints; making an appointment with the Fund's specialists; receiving information about the status of payments of payers from the Pension Fund of Ukraine (for legal entities and individuals-entrepreneurs) [8, p. 43-47].

At the regional level, local self-government bodies and local executive authorities develop separate electronic portals for rendering administrative services. For instance, the Regional Virtual Office of Electronic Administrative Services of the Dnipropetrovska Oblast; certain electronic administrative services are rendered on the website of the Centre for Administrative Services of the city of Ivano-Frankivsk, etc.

As for the availability of professional personnel, the introduction and implementation of electronic administrative services is impossible without the availability of a suitable number of trained and qualified specialists in the field of e-governance, which, for its part, is a component of public administration. Training of such persons should be aimed at reorienting the activities of government bodies, at performing the main function in the form of rendering administrative services, namely electronic administrative services, requires a thorough analysis of their powers, improving the function and tasks that make provision for direct communication with potential consumers of services. Furthermore, for civil servants who are actively involved in the provision of services, it is necessary that the centres for retraining and advanced training of employees of state authorities, local self-government bodies, state-owned enterprises, institutions, and organisations design continuous professional development concerning the e-governance issues, namely electronic administrative services.

It is important for the state to monitor training and achieve an understanding of duties in the process of rendering electronic administrative services by a civil servant and a local government official. That is why the Kherson National Technical University has developed a standard for training specialists in the speciality "Electronic governance" of the educational qualification level "Master" and licensed the training of 25 people in full-time education. According to the authors, the training of such specialists will contribute to the development of a unified information space of Ukraine, as well as improve relations in e-governance between the state, businesses, and citizens, and facilitate socio-economic, political, and cultural development of Ukraine.

A major step towards the development of electronic services was the adoption of the Concept of Development of System of Electronic Services in Ukraine in 2016[1], which defines the principal areas, mechanisms, and stages of development of an effective system for rendering administrative and other public services in electronic form in Ukraine. During 2016-2019, the Concept supported optimising the procedures for rendering administrative services, as well as implementing pilot projects to introduce the provision of priority services in electronic form[2]. The authors of this study fully agree that the development of the system of rendering administrative services through information and communication technologies directly depends on the development of the system of rendering administrative services in the country. At the same time, both digitalisation and automation of unified and standardised administrative services can increase the efficiency of government bodies' activities in rendering administrative services to citizens [21].

CONCLUSIONS

The authors found that the best ways to stimulate the completion of the key objectives of electronic administrative services in Ukraine are as follows: development of a step-by-step strategy of public authorities on the introduction of electronic services with monitoring of effectiveness and demand by citizens; improvement of the quality of administrative services and their accessibility for citizens and

---

1. Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine No. 649-p "On Approval of the Concept of Development of System of Electronic Services in Ukraine". (2017, September). Retrieved from http://zakon3.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/718-2013-%D1%80.
2. *Ibidem, 2017.*

organisations and development of a system for evaluating the quality of electronic administrative services; orientation of public authorities to the interests of applicants; improvement of the quality and efficiency of administrative processes by focusing on the final result; increase in the transparency of public authorities through the introduction of open electronic administrative services; creation of national industry information systems, as well as improvement of administrative processes in public authorities with the use of information and telecommunications technologies; determination of the rights, obligations, and responsibilities of the parties and officials involved in the provision of electronic administrative services; reduction of opportunities for administrative discretion of decision-makers; parallel existence of the centres of administrative services and unified licensing centres with a clear delineation of the scope of their activities, as basic elements of infrastructure of administrative services, which shall perform the confirmation function for documents received by the citizens from the state registers and databases; development of regional centres for the provision of electronic administrative services to extend service infrastructure of interaction between the subjects of the services; reduction of costs in the interaction of citizens and organisations with public authorities through the introduction of e-government; public monitoring of public authorities' performance of their assigned functions.

It was established that there are many legislative and regulatory documents in Ukraine that provide an opportunity to implement various electronic administrative services, for example:

– the Concept of Administrative Reform in Ukraine;

– the Law of Ukraine "On Administrative Services";

– the Law of Ukraine "On Access to Public Information";

– the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On the Procedure for Publishing Information on the Activities of Executive Authorities on the Internet";

– the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On Establishment of the Centre of Assistance to Institutional Development of Civil Service";

– the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On Approval of the Procedure for Maintaining the Unified State Portal of Administrative Services";

– the Resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On the Implementation of the Pilot Project Regarding the Use of Electronic Display of Information Contained in the Passport of a Citizen of Ukraine in the Form of a Card, and Electronic Display of Information Contained in the Passport of a Citizen of Ukraine for Travel Abroad";

– the Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On Approval of the Concept of E-governance Development in Ukraine";

– the Order of the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine "On Approval of the Concept of Development of System of Electronic Services in Ukraine".

The modern development of the information society determines the widespread use of information and communication technologies in the public administration system, in particular the introduction of e-governance in the field of public administration in Ukraine, within which various governance services are provided. Proper and effective administrative and legal support of access to management services and e-governance in Ukraine is an urgent need in the context of the development of Ukraine as a democratic and legal state, as well as the evolution of civil society, since electronic administrative services, as a modernised process of public administration and the degree of implementation of its tasks, necessitate the activation of research on the legal settlement of this issue.

Thus, a well-built system of electronic administrative services in Ukraine will have a positive impact on the development of the social state with influential civil society institutions, especially on those issues where methods and forms of interaction of public administration bodies with citizens and business entities are of immense importance.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The value of the subject matter is shown in the fact that one of the most critical issues of modern society is the development and improvement of the level of participation of citizens through information and communication technologies in state affairs of Ukraine. Electronic administrative services, as a modernised public administration process and the degree of implementation of its tasks, necessitate the activation of research on the legal settlement of this issue.

REFERENCES

[1] Politanskyiy, V.S. (2018). Doctrine concept e-government. *Legea si Viata*, 1/2(313), 98-101.

[2] Horbulin, V.P., Hrytsiak, N.V., Semenchenko, A.I., & Karpenko, O.V. (2014). *E-government*. Kyiv: NAPA.

[3] Zahorskyi, V.S., & Teleshun, S.O. (Eds.). (2011). *Encyclopedia of public administration* (Vol. 8). Lviv: LRIPA NAPA.

[4] Pedrosa, G.V., Kosloski, R.A.D., Menezes, V.G., Iwama, G.Y., Silva, W.C.M.P., & Figueiredo, R.M.C. (2020). A systematic review of indicators for evaluating the effectiveness of digital public services. *Information*, 11(10), article number 472.

[5] Margariti, V., Anagnostopoulos, D., Papastilianou, A., & Stamati, T. (2020). Assessment of organizational interoperability in e-government: A new model and tool for assessing organizational interoperability maturity of a public service in practice. In Y. Charalabidis, M.A. Cunha, & D. Sarantis (Eds.), *ICEGOV 2020: materials of the 13th International conference on theory and practice of electronic governance* (pp. 298-308). New York: Association for Computing Machinery.

[6] Noordt, C., & Misuraca, G. (2020). Evaluating the impact of artificial intelligence technologies in public services: Towards an assessment framework. In Y. Charalabidis, M.A. Cunha, & D. Sarantis (Eds.), *ICEGOV 2020: materials of the 13th International conference on theory and practice of electronic governance* (pp. 8-16). New York: Association for Computing Machinery.

[7] Al-Refaie, A., & Ramadna, A. (2017). Barriers to e-government adoption in Jordanian organizations from users' and employees' perspectives. *International Journal of Electronic Government Research*, 13(1), 33-51.

[8] Špaček, D., Csótó, M., & Urs, N. (2020). Questioning the real citizen-centricity of e-government development: Digitalization of G2C services in selected CEE countries. *Journal of Public Administration and Policy*, 13(1), 213-243.

[9] Kaluti, M., & Rajani, K.C. (2021). E-governance for public administration. *Lecture Notes in Electrical Engineering,* 698, 1059-1065.

[10] Klich, A. (2021). Electronic communication with public administration in the time of COVID-19 – Poland's experience. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(2), article number 685.

[11] Marzooqi, S.A., Nuaimi, E.A., & Qirim, N.A. (2017). E-governance (G2C) in the public sector: Citizens acceptance to e-government systems – Dubai's case. In H. Hamdan, D.E. Boubiche, & F. Hidoussi (Eds.), *ICC 2017: Materials of the second international conference on internet of things, data and cloud computing* (pp. 1-11). New York: Association for Computing Machinery.

[12] Park, H.M. (2015). Should e-government be transformational and participatory? An essay on e-government in the utilitarian mode of information technology use. In *Proceedings of the 48th Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Science* (pp. 2476-2485). Piscataway: The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers.

[13] Rocha, J. (2020). Spanish and Portuguese eIDAS node evolution for electronic identification of European citizens. In *EATIS 2020: Materials of the scientific conference* (pp. 1-5). New York: Association for Computing Machinery.

[14] Babaiev, V.M., Novikova, M.M., & Haiduchenko, S.O. (2014). *Text of lectures on the subject "E-government"*. Kharkiv: NUUEK.

[15] Bukhanevych, O.M. (2015). Implementation of electronic problems administrative services in Ukraine. *Kherson State University Herald. Series "Legal Sciences"*, 3(2), 57-60.

[16] Danylevych, S.Ya. (2017). *Implementation of innovative management technologies of e-government in state bodies of Ukraine*. Retrieved from http://surl.li/wpga.

[17] Dzoban, O.P. (2013). *Philosophy of information law: Worldview and general theoretical principles*. Kharkiv: Maidan.

[18] Klimushin, P.S. (2010). Definition of mechanisms of realization of electronic democracy and rendering of electronic public services. *Theory and Practice of Public Administration*, 1(28), 263-270.

[19] Kozachencko, N. (2013). The activities of public servants to provide administrative services: Legal regulation and implementation issues in Ukraine. *Public Administration and Local Government*, 1(16), 194-202.

[20] Kuspliak, I.S. (2012). *Electronic government as a tool for the formation of transparent and open political power* (Candidate thesis, South Ukrainian National Pedagogical University named after K.D. Ushynsky, Odesa, Ukraine).

[21] Litvinov, O.V. (n.d.). *Citizens' access to administrative services using IT technologie*s. Retrieved from http://dcsi.dp.ua/novini-dnipropetrovschini/noviy-format/dostup-gromadyan-do-administrativnih-poslug-iz-vikoristannyam-%D1%96t-technology.

[22] Mirzoian, A.A. (2005). Service as a civil law category. *International Law and National Legislation*, 1, 127-138.

[23] Trebyk, L.P. (2014). Status and prospects of providing electronic administrative services to citizens by public servants. *University Scientific Notes*, 4, 217-222.

[24] Maliukova, I.H. (Ed.). (2007). *E-government in Ukraine: Analysis and recommendations. The results of the study.* Kyiv: Polihraf-Plius.

[25] Tymoshchuk, V.P., & Kurinnyi, O.V. (Eds.). (2015). *Administrative services: Status and prospects of reform.* Kyiv: Center for Political and Legal Reforms.

[26] Unified state portal of administrative services. (n.d.). Retrieved from https://poslugy.gov.ua/.

[27] The President, the Prime Minister, and the Ministry of Finance presented the mobile application "Action". (2020). Retrieved from https://www.kmu.gov.ua/news/prezident-premyer-ministr-mincifra-prezentuvali-mobilnij-zastosunok-diya.

[28] Electronic passport in the mobile application "Action". (n.d.). Retrieved from https https://www.legalaid.gov.ua/novyny/elektronnyj-pasport-u-mobilnomu-dodatku-diya/.

[29] Public services online. (n.d.). Retrieved from https://diia.gov.ua/.

[30] Electronic administrative services in the field of construction have started operating in Ukraine. (n.d.). Retrieved from http://www.dabi.gov.ua/index.php/pres-sluzhba/novini/1323-v-ukrajini-zapratsyuvali-elektronniadminposlugi-u-sferi-budivnitstva.

[31] The first electronic service in the environmental field was introduced. (n.d.). Retrieved from http://www.menr.gov.ua/press-center/news/123-news1/3997-zaprovadzheno-pershu-elektronnu-posluhu-v-ekolohichniy-sferi.

[32] Cabinet of electronic services of the Ministry of Justice of Ukraine. (n.d.). Retrieved from https://kap.minjust.gov.ua/.

[33] Semenchenko, A.I., & Dreshpak, V.M. (Eds.). (2017). *E-government and e-democracy* (Vol. 10). Kyiv: FOP Moskalenko O.M.

Yevhen A. Hetman

Doctor of Law, Professor
Chief Scientific Secretary
Corresponding Member
National Academy of Legal Sciences of Ukraine
61024, 70 Pushkinska Str., Kharkiv, Ukraine

Department of Private International Law and Comparative Law
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University
61024, 77 Pushkinska Str., Kharkiv, Ukraine

Viacheslav S. Politanskyi

Candidate of Law, Assistant
Head of the Department of Coordination of Legal Studies
National Academy of Legal Sciences of Ukraine
61024, 70 Pushkinska Str., Kharkiv, Ukraine

Department of Theory and Philosophy of Law
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University
61024, 77 Pushkinska Str., Kharkiv, Ukraine

Ihor V. Semenikhin

Candidate of Law, Assistant
Department of Theory and Philosophy of Law
Yaroslav Mudryi National Law University
61024, 77 Pushkinska Str., Kharkiv, Ukraine